

仏教的実践へのアプローチ： —フィリップ・カプローとジョン・カバット・ジンの著作を中心に—

Approaches toward Buddhist Practices:

By Focusing on Writings of Philip Kapleau and Jon Kabat-Zinn

Shreya WAGH

本論文の目的は、フィリップ・カプローとジョン・カバット・ジンの著作に焦点を当て、仏教の実践へのアプローチを分析することである。カプローはロチェスター禅センターの禅師であり、カバット・ジンは仏教的な実践をルーツにした「マインドフルネスストレス低減法」の開発者である。カプローは禅について、カバット・ジンはマインドフルネスについて様々な本を出版した。本論文では、カプローの *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965) と *Zen Dawn in the West* (1979) をカバット・ジンの *Full Catastrophe Living* (1990) と *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994) と比較し、彼らの仏教へのアプローチを明らかにする。カプローは禅をアメリカ人にわかりやすく説明した。しかし、禅宗から宗教色を排除したり、伝統的な実践法を変更したりしなかった。一方、カバット・ジンは、仏教の実践法から精神的、肉体的治療に必要な要素を抜粋し、その効果を科学的に証明した。また、その実践をアメリカ人に説明するとき、宗教色を全面に出さなかった。その結果、マインドフルネスは非常に普及し、医療機関、学校、企業、軍隊をはじめ様々な分野で使われるようになった。

カプローとカバット・ジンの著作を分析すると、禅とマインドフルネスの共通点と相違点が明らかとなる。共通点として最も重要なのは瞑想と、「今の瞬間に意識を向ける」という仏教的な考え方である。禅とマインドフルネスの相違点は多様である。禅の修行には悟りを開くという目的があり、マインドフルネスには治療、リラクゼーション、能力開発、社会福祉という目的がある。マインドフルネスは、誰でもどこでも実践できる。一方、禅では仏教の伝統的な修行が必要とされる。以上のような多くの相違点があっても禅とマインドフルネスは同じ仏教から開発された方法であることに違いはない。

キーワード：フィリップ・カプロー、ジョン・カバット・ジン、禅、マインドフルネス、仏教

1. Introduction

The purpose of this paper is to understand the approaches toward Buddhist practices, by focusing on the writings of Philip Kapleau

(1912-2004) and Jon Kabat-Zinn (1944-). Both, Kapleau and Kabat-Zinn are born and brought up in the United states. They learned Buddhism and implemented it in different ways. Kapleau is a Zen master who introduced Japanese Zen to

American people while, Kabat-Zin developed a stress reduction program called ‘Mindfulness-based Stress Reduction’ (MBSR) which is inspired and influenced by various Buddhist practices.

The word Mindfulness is an English translation of Pali word *Sati*. *Sati*, in Pali means ‘memory’ or ‘remembrance’ (Wilson 2014: 15; Kucinskas 2019: 26). Mindfulness has various techniques inspired by Buddhist practices. However, Mindfulness is always presented in secular and non-religious way. There is a wide range of scientific study that show the benefits of Mindfulness for mental and physical health and to maintain wellbeing. According to the report published by Harvard University in 2018, clinical studies on Mindfulness have increased from 1 in 1995-97 to 216 in 2013-15. According to the report published in 2019 by American Mindfulness research association, the number of articles published with “Mindfulness” in title were 1,203 in 2018. Over a past few decades, Mindfulness meditation has spread rapidly not only in medical institutions but also in schools, companies, military, prisons and various other fields in the Unites states. Mindfulness programs are also spreading all over the world. Mindfulness courses are also conducted in Japan. The number of organizations that conduct such courses is increasing.

There are numerous studies on Zen Buddhism in the United states. Also, there is a wide research available on Mindfulness and its clinical application in various fields. However, there are very few studies which explain the influence of Buddhism, especially Zen Buddhism on Mindfulness. Ville Husgafvel (2019) explains

about Buddhist influence on Jon Kabat-Zinn’s MBSR. By analyzing Jon Kabat-Zinn’s *Full Catastrophe Living* (1990), *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994) and *Coming to our senses* (2005), he identifies the influence of Theravada Buddhism - neo Vipassanā movement and Mahayana Buddhism – Zen/Sōn/ Thiền and Tibetan Dzogchen teachings on Kabat-Zinn’s MBSR and related mindfulness-based programs (MBPs). There are some comparative studies. Tadashi Chihara (2020) compares Dogen’s Zen and Mindfulness by focusing on their theories and application. There are also some articles which compare Zen and Mindfulness. There is a dialogue between Masaki Matsubara, a Zen scholar from Cornell University and a priest in San Francisco Zen center and Kimiko Bokura-a founder of Mindfulness institute of leadership (MiLI). They discuss the differences between American Mindfulness and Japanese Zen. There is another dialogue between Hiroaki Kumano, a professor of clinical psychology at Waseda University and Nanrei Yokota, a chief priest of Rinzai division at Engaku-ji temple. It is published in the bulletin (2020) of Hanazono University Counselling Center. Kumano explains about the Mindfulness meditation techniques and Yokota explains Zen meditation techniques. These studies compare American Mindfulness and other Buddhist practices. In this paper, I compare the writings of two Americans who learned Buddhism and applied it in contemporary way. By comparing their books, I try to identify fundamental similarities and differences between Zen and Mindfulness.

I analyze two books of Philip Kapleau and two of Jon Kabat-Zinn to understand their approach

toward Buddhist practices. The analysis is based on the books: *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965) and *Zen Dawn in the West* (1979) by Philip Kapleau and, *Full Catastrophe Living* (1990) and *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994) by Jon Kabat-Zinn. These books are best sellers of their times and still used widely all over the world. They have been translated into several languages. They are the initial and important works of Kapleau and Kabat-Zinn. Their writings are based on Buddhist practices but, the approach and implementation have differences. In this paper I cover the fundamental differences between Mindfulness and Zen that can be identified from Kapleau and Kabat-Zinn's writings. Also, the comparison is based on only two books of Kapleau and two of Kabat-Zinn. Therefore, it does not cover all the similarities and differences that Mindfulness and Zen may have. This is an attempt to analyze the approach of two American writers toward Buddhism. The outcome of this paper can be a first step to understand changing approaches toward Buddhist practices.

2. Philip Kapleau and Jon Kabat-Zinn

Philip Kapleau is an American Zen master who Founded Rochester Zen Center in New York in 1965. Rochester Zen Center is one of the largest and well-known Buddhist Centers in North America. Kapleau was initially a reporter. He went to Japan to cover war trails. He attended several lectures of D. T. Suzuki² (1870-1966) in America where he got introduced to Zen. He began his Zen training under Soen Nakagawa³ (1907-1984) in Rinzai tradition. After that, he continued his training with Daiun Sogaku Harada⁴

(1871-1961) and with Hakuun Yasutani⁵ (1885-1973) in Sambo Kyodan⁶ sect. He spent thirteen years and eventually ordained by his master Yasutani Roshi who allowed him to teach Zen. To spread Zen teachings in American society, Kapleau wanted to make changes by translating the chants into English, using western Buddhist names, performing ceremonies, rituals according to western culture, wearing western cloths while practicing Zen etc. He had arguments with his master over such changes. Kapleau states in one of his books, "... to see that Buddha's dharma was flexible enough to accommodate itself to widely differing cultures and to develop according to the spiritual climate prevailing wherever it is introduced" (Kapleau 1979: 269). Kapleau returned to the United States in 1965 to establish Rochester Zen Center. He taught Zen for many years. Kapleau was a profound writer and speaker who did not just explain Zen Buddhism, but focused on its application and adaptation in the western culture. He gave several lectures in the United states and wrote several books.

Jon Kabat-Zinn is a designer of Mindfulness-based Stress Reduction (MBSR)" program in which he teaches Buddhist techniques in a non-religious way. Kabat-Zinn received his PhD. in Molecular Biology from Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT). During his college days, he was exposed to Philip Kapleau's *The Three pillars of Zen* (1965) (Seager 1999: 254) and attended several lectures on Buddhism. He learnt Buddhist practices from Philip Kapleau, Thích Nhất Hạnh (1926-) - a monk of Vietnamese Mahayana tradition and Seung Sahn (1927-2004) - a Zen master from Korea. He was also associated with Insight Meditation society (IMS). Kabat-Zinn

learned Buddhist practices and integrated them with scientific findings. In one of his papers, he mentions that he had a ten second 'vision' or flash during a ten days *Vipassanā* retreat of Insight meditation Society. After a flood of thoughts, he had an idea of implementing Buddhist teachings or dharma in clinical environment rather than focusing on its cultural or traditional aspects. He thought cultural or traditional aspects of dharma would be an unnecessary impediment for people who are suffering from stress, illnesses and pain (Kabat-Zinn 2011: 287).

He realized the potential benefits of Buddhist teachings . In 1979, he started a Stress Reduction Clinic at the University of Massachusetts Medical School. He designed a stress reduction and relaxation program which he later named as "Mindfulness-based Stress Reduction (MBSR)" program. Under this program, he started teaching Buddhist techniques to reduce mental and physical problems of the patients. Kabat-Zinn defines Mindfulness as 'the awareness that arises by paying attention on purpose, in the present moment, and non-judgmentally' (Kabat-Zinn 2013: xxxv). Non-Judgmentally does not mean not judging or evaluating but to realize how judgmental the mind can be and not get caught in the suffering by judging. Awareness is not same as thinking. It is an innate, constitutive approach defining aspect of humanity (Kabat-Zinn 2017: sec. 2, para. 1). Kabat-Zinn is also a profound writer and speaker. His MBSR program and Mindfulness teachings have inspired thousands of people in the United states and all over the world.

3. *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965)

The Three Pillars of Zen was first published in 1965. In this book, Kapleau explains about the three pillars of Zen that are Teaching, Practice and Enlightenment. The book is divided into three parts that include English translation of lectures given by of Hakuun Yasutani (Yasutani Roshi) on Zen Buddhism, Yasutani Roshi's private lectures to ten westerners, letters and passages related to Zen Buddhism. For this analysis, I refer the edition that was published in 1967.

Part one focusses on the first two pillars of Zen that are Teaching and Practice. It is further divided into four sections. In the first section, Kapleau has given a biographical note on Yasutani Roshi and translation of twelve of his lectures. The lectures are on fundamentals of Zazen such as way of practicing it, precautions in Zazen, Illusions etc. The lectures also explain about types of Zazen, aims of Zazen, importance of individual instructions (*Sesshin*), the practice of *Shikan-taza*, essentials and aspirations of Zen practice etc. They also talk about the principles of Zazen such as relationship of cause and effect, Oneness and Manyness.

The second section discusses about Koan⁷ and principles of Buddhism through Yasutani Roshi's commentary (*teishō*) on the Koan 'Mu'. 'Mu' is the Koan in which Joshu⁸ (778–897) retorts one of his disciples' question as "Mu" when the disciple asks whether dogs have the Buddha-nature. Mu has collection of forty-eight Koans (Kapleau 1967: 63-64). Koans are not just paradoxical statements said by Zen masters. They the unique expressions of living. Kapleau states, "The great merit of koans, which range over the vast area

of the Mahayana teachings, is that they compel us, in ingenious and often dramatic fashion, to learn these doctrines not simply with our head but with our whole being, refusing to permit us to sit back and endlessly theorize about them in the abstract” (Kapleau 1967: 64-65). After providing explanation on Koan, Kapleau presents the actual commentary by Yasutani Roshi. The commentary is given in front of thirty-five laymen during the *Sesshin* in 1961. Such commentaries provide numerous clues to the disciples. Yasutani Roshi talks about Buddha nature and Dharma nature. They are basically same because Buddha comes from Dharma (Kapleau 1967: 69-74). Dharma is a phenomenon arose due to the law of cause and effect. The substance of Buddha or Dharma nature is *Kū* (*shunyata*)⁹. Once the *Kū* is realized, one understands the phenomenon of Buddha or Dharma. Yasutani Roshi further explains each line said by Joshu in the Koan *Mu*. The Koan is not understood intellectually, but one has to practice it with devotion to attain enlightenment.

In the third section, Kapleau emphasizes on practical application of Zen and presents Yasutani Roshi’s private encounters with ten westerners, men and women from the age of 25 to 60. As per the practices given to them by Yasutani Roshi, they ask several questions and Yasutani Roshi answers them. The questions are on ego, experiences, sitting in *Zazen*, *Shikan-taza*, Koan *Mu*, concentration, enlightenment and several other topics. They are very deep and extensive. Therefore, they cannot be compiled or explained in detail in this paper. However, this section covers practices and concepts of Zen. The fourth section is about the talk on Dharma by Bassui¹⁰ (1327–1387) and letters of him. In the first half

of the section, Kapleau gives brief introduction of Basui and his journey of life. He also explains how Basui soaked himself in Zen through his natural Koan “who is the master?”. In the second half, Kapleau provides English translation for Basui’s Dharma talk and his letters. In the Dharma talk, Basui talks about awakening oneself and freeing oneself from the suffering. One has to have thirst for the awakening and one has to strive for realization in the present life. Further to the Dharma talk, Kapleau presents twelve letters by Basui to different people in which Basui answers their questions or comments on their experiences while practicing Zen.

Part two focusses on the third pillar of Zen that is enlightenment in which he shares eight enlightenment experiences of Japanese and Westerners. This section is added to make the readers, especially western readers realize that self-realization can be attained in the modern lifestyle. One does not have to be monk or live in monasteries to achieve enlightenment. In the second section, he shares Yaeko Iwasaki¹¹’s enlightenment letters to Harada Roshi and his reply to those letters. Kapleau first provides a brief background of Yaeko Iwasaki and Harada Roshi. In the letters written by Yaeko Iwasaki, she writes about her *Kenshō* experiences and about her death in the last letter. The purpose of these letters is to make readers understand the essence of living Buddhism as Kapleau expresses (Kapleau 1967: 269).

Kapleau provides supplements in Part three. First, he explains about one of the great Zen masters, Dogen Kigen (Dogen Eihei – Monastic name) (1200-1253) and his famous work *Shōbōgenzō* (A Treasury of the Eye—that is, of

the opened Mind's eye—of the True Dharma). *Shōbōgenzō* has ninety-five sections in which master Dogen deals with simple matters and highly metaphysical matters of time and being. Kapleau presents a brief extract from *Shōbōgenzō* to give the readers an idea of master Dogen's insights on time and being. He further states "These passages ought not to be read as abstract metaphysic. Dogen is not speculating about the character of time and being, but is speaking out of his deepest experience of that reality. Always his overriding concern is with practice and enlightenment, with leading his readers to the realization of the truth of themselves and the universe" (Kapleau 1967: 296). In the latter half of the section, Kapleau presents the widely known Oxherding pictures¹² with commentaries. In the end of the book, Kapleau talks about Zazen postures with illustrations. He also answers the commonly asked questions about Zen which include method of breathing, body posture, pain in the body because of or while doing Zazen etc.

The Three Pillars of Zen (1965) is considered as one of the first books providing overview of Zen Buddhism in English. The translation of Yasutani Roshi's lectures and letters do provide an insight to the Zen practice but, Kapleau's commentary on each part and each section deepens the understanding of Zen that Yasutani has used in his lectures and letters.

4. *Zen Dawn in the West* (1979)

Zen Dawn in the West was first published in the United States in 1979. The book is divided into four parts that include the dialogues from the lectures that Kapleau gave in the last twelve

years. They are not private lectures but general lectures, public talks. It also includes students' experiences, letters written by Kapleau to his students, Buddhist rituals and gestures etc. The target audience of the book is the people who are interested in understanding and following Zen Buddhism. For this analysis, I refer the first edition that was published in 1979.

In Part one, there are thirty dialogues with students at Rochester Zen center where he discusses various topics such as Origin of Zen, Zen and psychotherapy, enlightenment, emptiness, anger, religion. The students are from different backgrounds and religions. The answers given by Kapleau give a basic idea of Zen and its philosophy. The answers are sometimes paradoxical but, Kapleau provides further clarifications. He explains that Zen is not something to speak about. It is an experience. While explaining about the relation of Zen and Psychotherapy, Kapleau states that Psychotherapy might help people to prepare for Zen. He also talks about vegetarianism. When one goes deep into Zen, he naturally develops preference for vegetarian food. Kapleau also talks about the role of teacher in Zen. He says that, the Zen teacher does not control his disciple's life but provides him guidance to reach the enlightenment. In some of the answers, Kapleau talks about other forms of meditation such as Transcendental meditation. He also talks about religion. When someone practices Zen, he is neither Catholic nor Buddhist. Some questions are on enlightenment and emptiness. One of the important answers is on Buddhist principles of birth and death. Kapleau provides graphical representation to explain nine levels consciousness. The first six levels are the

five senses and thinking. They vanish when the physical body dies. However, the seventh, eighth and ninth level of consciousness never dies with the death of physical body. When one reaches to the ninth level of consciousness, he sees his true nature (Kapleau 1979: 70-72). In the last conversations, he talks about the importance of Koan.

In part two Kapleau presents the encouragement talks and commentaries in Seven days individual instructions (*Sesshin*) held at Rochester center with fifty-five people. The encouragement talks actually start from the fourth day of *sesshin* when the collective energy of *Sesshin* reaches to the point where encouragement is necessary. Kapleau states “the encouragement talk can become catalyst which inspires participants to propel themselves beyond their imagined limits” (Kapleau 1979: 96). The encouragement talks are mainly about *Makyō*¹³, koan *Mu*, Bodhidharma¹⁴, thinking etc. Kapleau tries to explain Zen principles through these talks and provide clues and ideas to the students during the seven days *Sesshin*. In the second section of part two, Kapleau talks about enlightenment. Enlightenment is a freedom from sufferings. It is a bundle of joy and peace that one experiences. In this section, Kapleau also replies to some of his disciples’ letters.

Part three of the book is about Devotion. In this part, Kapleau emphasizes on the ceremonies and rituals of Zen. He also talks about the four Bodhisatvic vows through a widely recited chant in Mahayana Buddhism. Through these vows, one can have a sense of Zen. Kapleau further talks about the very famous Heart Sutra, Hakuin¹⁵’s chant for Zazen and affirming faith in

Mind by the third patriarch of Zen, Seng Tsan. In the next section, Kapleau replies to one of his disciple’s letters where he talks about religion. The disciple writes to Kapleau that she is brought up in a Christian family and the religious aspects of Zen (chanting, bowing to Buddha, offering food etc.) turns her off. Kapleau replies to her that devotional aspects of Zen are to create deep awareness which leads to enlightenment. He explains it with a story of Zen master Huang Po¹⁶. He further explains that every Buddha figure is not just a symbol but stands as a vivid manifestation of our true mind (Kapleau 1979: 193). Chanting sutras help to create the state of no-mindfulness. In short, rituals of Zen are far beyond actions. One should use them as a tool to deepen the awareness. In this sections, Kapleau also talks about compassion and confession of bad deeds.

Part four is about Morality and social responsibility. This part contains Kapleau’s letters, dialogues and Dharma talk about responsiveness. “In Zen the essence of Morality and social responsibility is responsiveness: wholeheartedly responding to the demands of circumstances and to the legitimate needs of others. To develop this responsiveness has always been a central aim of Zen training” (Kapleau 1979: 209-210). In this section Kapleau answers many questions regarding Zen precepts, meditation, moral dilemmas etc. In the last sections he discusses the first precept of Zen that is to cherish the life and not to kill.

Zen Dawn in the West (1979) is a companion volume of *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965). Since the book is a compilation of Kapleau’s talks and commentaries that he gave in the United states, it

answers some of the fundamental questions that western people might have about Zen.

5. *Full Catastrophe Living* (1990)

Jon Kabat-Zinn's *Full Catastrophe Living* was first published in the United States in 1990. It is an introductory book about mindfulness meditation and Mindfulness based stress reduction (MBSR) program. It explains how mindfulness practices can reduce mental stress, physical pain and chronic problems of the patients. The book is divided into five parts that discuss about Mindfulness practice, new way towards illnesses, dealing day to day stress, awareness etc. For this analysis, I refer the edition that was published in 2013.

In Part one Kabat-Zinn provides an introduction to his MBSR program. He explains basic techniques of Mindfulness such as paying attention, receptiveness, commitment etc. He calls them seven pillars of mindfulness that they teach in MBSR program. They are non-judging, patience, a beginner's mind, trust, non-striving, acceptance and letting go (Kabat-Zinn 2013: 21). In the third chapter, he explains about power of breathing. He describes the function of heart when one breathes. He explains various breathing techniques that he uses in MBSR program and its effects on the body. He provides exercises that readers can practice on their own. In the Forth chapter, he thoroughly explains the process of meditation starting from sitting position to getting out of meditation. In the Fifth chapter, he gives detailed explanation about body-scan meditation. He provides scientific evidence on the effects of body-scan mediation and how his

patients benefited from it. In the Sixth chapter he explains the importance of mindful Yoga, by paying attention to different Yoga postures. He provides illustrations of yoga postures that they teach in MBSR program. In the Seventh chapter, he provides another example of meditation that is Walking meditation in which one walks with all his attention to walking. In the Eighth and Ninth chapters, he provides examples of his patients and explains how one can practice mindfulness in day-to-day life. In the last chapter of Part one, he provides the whole curriculum of MBSR program to give idea on how and from where one can start Mindfulness practice.

In the first chapter of part two, Kabat-Zinn writes about how he designed the MBSR program and how individual development is an integral part of it. He denies the dual approach of Mind and body. He rather considers it as a whole. In the next chapter, he elaborates the concept of mind and body as whole by providing examples of scientific researches in this field. In the next chapter, he explains about healing as a transformative way which involves interconnectedness and wholeness (Kabat-Zinn 2013: 217). In the fourth chapter of part two, he gives his readers an overview of new advances and developments in the fields of life sciences and health care. He emphasizes that the researchers are putting efforts in creating mindfulness relationship between doctor and patient. In the fifth chapter, he provides a range of evidences that support a new approach of mind and body to reduce stress and illnesses. He explains the importance and role of thoughts, feelings and behavior in reducing stress and curing illnesses. He emphasizes that by mobilizing these inner

resources, one can lead towards better living and better being.

Part three is about Stress. In the first chapter, Kabat-Zinn explains about the “Stressors” – the stimuli that cause stress. He also provides a brief history of the word stress and people who researched about stress. He tells the readers that with Mindfulness practice, one can change the way to look at stress and that can lower the stress. In the second chapter, he explains that “change” is the integral and inevitable part of our life which can also be a great stressor. Especially the life events are such as marriage, job, having child etc. are the causes of good stress and they may turn into bad stress after some time. He explains the physiological and psychological processes of creation of stress and response of stress. By applying Mindfulness techniques, one can have different perspective towards change and can balance stressful situations. In the third chapter, he explains “Stress reaction cycle” with illustration. He thoroughly explains about mechanism of body to react to stress when it faces any stressful situation. He also gives various types of stressors. He explains that, people get stuck in the vicious cycle of stressors and stress reaction. People do not realize that there many ways to look at stress and most important way is to respond to stress skillfully rather than reacting to stress. In the last chapter of this part, he again provides illustration to explain how to cope with stress by responding to it with MBSR, rather than reacting to it.

In Part four first chapter, he explains about body symptoms that his patients come with and how MBSR helps them to reduce many of the symptoms in just eight weeks. He tells his

patients and readers to listen to the body. In the second and third chapters he explains about how mindfulness meditations help in reducing pain. In the next couple of chapters, he explains how to cope with emotions mindfully, especially with fear, panic and anxiety. He also explains how Mindful based cognitive therapy (MBCT) helps people in coping depression. In the next chapters he describes various factors that are causing a lot of stress without our notion such as Time stress, Sleep stress, People stress, Role stress, Work stress, Food stress and World stress. He asks his readers to take some time to observe these stressors carefully, sit back and deal with them easily. In this way, Part four is the most important part of the book where Kabat-Zinn explains the readers how to deal with the day-to-day catastrophe we are going through.

In Part five, Kabat-Zinn explains how the MBSR program ends and how the participants get a new approach towards life. He also gives examples of some of his patients, how they were before and how they are after the program. In the second chapter he emphasizes on the continuation of practice with the CDs. He also explains how to cultivate mindfulness systematically reducing the pre-notions about mindfulness and meditation. In the end of the book, he gives eight-week practice schedule of MBSR and awareness exercises to practice.

Full catastrophe living (1990) is the best guide for Kabat-Zinn’s MBSR program. The book provides explanation on Mindfulness meditations, Yoga and other techniques that are used in MBSR program. The book has Kabat-Zinn’s and his patients’ experiences which explain the readers about the importance of mindfulness in dealing

with mental and physical problems. It has many exercises which one can do on his own. The book is technical with many explanations on mental and physiological phenomenon. The book hardly talks about Buddhism. Also, it has wide range of scientific explanations and mental and physical mechanisms which allow the readers to think that Mindfulness in a scientifically proven and secular practice.

6. *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994)

Wherever You Go, There You Are was first published in the United States in 1994. It is an introductory book about mindfulness meditation and how to be mindful in everyday life by adopting some habits. It also explains how mindfulness practices can reduce and cure mental stress, physical pain and chronic problems. The book is divided into three parts, discussing about mindfulness, simple Buddhist principles, application of meditation, techniques to improve quality of meditation, perspectives and approaches for mindfulness. The target audience of the books is general public who are curious to know about mindfulness and who are having stress, physical pain and illness. For this analysis, I refer the edition that was published in 2005.

In the first chapter of the first part, Kabat-Zinn explains the concept of mindfulness, its roots and how common people can apply it in their day to day lives in a secular way. He explains that Mindfulness is paying attention to the Particular moment without being judgmental about it. He also mentions that “Mindfulness has been called the heart of Buddhist Meditation” (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 4) and “the key to this path,

which lies at the root of Buddhism, Taoism and yoga, and which we also find in works of people like Emerson, Thoreau, and in Native American wisdom....” (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 5). He clearly states that Mindfulness is a religious practice. However, he also states that “Religion has traditionally been the domain of such fundamental inquiries within a spiritual framework, but mindfulness has little to do with religion, except in the most fundamental meaning of the word” (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 6). In this way, In the very first chapter he clears his non-religious approach suggesting his readers that though Mindfulness practices has their roots in various religions and philosophies, one does not have to be a Yogi or Buddhist as the basic principle of Buddhism is not to become anything and focusing on oneself.

In the further few chapters of part one, he provides an idea of mindfulness practices, what is being done and how it has to be done. He also explains the importance of present moment and being completely in the present moment without thinking about past and future as people get caught up and focus on the outcomes of meditations, rather than being in meditation. He explains the important of breath and daily practice, although the practice can be done only for 45 minutes a day and not putting everything in it. In short, one can practice mindfulness anywhere without disturbing daily routine. In the next few chapters, he explains the fundamentals required for mindfulness practices. They include non-doing, patience, letting go, Non-judging, trust, generosity, strength, simplicity, concentration and vision. He also explains the relevance of these characteristics in mindfulness practices and how one can deepen the practices to

become full human being. In the last few chapters, he elaborates the concept of meditation and tries to reduce myths and paradoxes associated with Meditation. He also mentions that Meditation is considered as a path in Buddhism and Taoism. Similarly, one should continue drawing one's own path with Mindfully till one is alive.

In the second part of the book, Kabat-Zinn explains how one can do mindful meditation. In the first few chapters he explains about sitting posture, hand positions, going into meditation and coming out of meditation. He provides references to Zen practices while explaining about posture for meditation and coming out of meditation and Mudras while explaining positions of hands. In the next few chapters, he writes how long the practice should be done and there is no right way to practice. He also asks his readers to ask questions such as "Who am I", "Where I am going?" "What path I am on?" etc. (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 132) while meditating. In the last few chapters, he provides practical guide to several mindfulness meditations, including Mountain Meditation, The Lake mediation, Walking Meditation, Standing Meditation, Lying-Down Meditation and Loving Kindness meditation. He elaborates about these meditations by explaining what has to be done in those meditations and how the names are relevant to the techniques of meditations. He also emphasizes that one should lie down on the floor at least once a day when you can be one with the moment. The concept of lying down on the floor is unusual to western people and therefore, he explains the significance of it in mindfulness practices. He also refers to Hatha Yoga and further emphasizes on being complete aware (mindful) while doing Yoga. In the last

chapter of Loving Kindness Meditation, he mentions to show the richness of Asian cultures, "Maybe we are overdeveloped outwardly and underdeveloped inwardly. Perhaps it is we who, for all our wealth, are living in poverty" (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 163). This shows his respect towards Asian culture.

In the third part of the book, Kabat-Zinn discusses about various topics related to Mindful life such as importance of nature, importance of discipline, acknowledging good qualities in oneself, taking responsibility and not changing the direction, being completely present in the actions. He also provides his own examples, what he does in his daily routine and how he has made mindfulness integral part of his life. He also shares his experiences of teaching his medical students about mindful habits. He also asks his readers to go inside and search the role that each one of us have got on this planet. He calls it "Job" with a Capital J (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 206). He conceptualizes the universe as an employer and all humane being as its employees. This helps to find out one's Job on this planet. Kabat-Zinn also discusses about Asian principles of non-violence (*Ahimsa*), Karma, wholeness, oneness etc. He keeps mentioning about the questions to be asked to oneself and go deeper and deeper in meditation.

In one of the chapters, he discusses about "Selfing". Selfing is an activity where one attaches oneself to the things, circumstances and emotions around oneself. For example, "my" moment, "my" experience, "my" child, "my" hunger etc. (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 236). One gets caught up in these "I", "My" and "Mine". Kabat-Zinn tells his readers to not take the life so seriously and come out of

the pressures, self-oriented thinking. This is the principle of “Letting go” and allowing universe to work for you. In the next chapter he writes about Anger. He asks the readers to observe the emotions when they are angry and before reacting. This is the way of being mindful even if the situations are not in your favor and you get angry. In next few chapters he discusses about mindful parenting. He writes that “Parenting and family life can be a perfect field for mindfulness practice, but it’s not for the weak-hearted, the selfish or lazy, or the hopelessly romantic. Parenting is a mirror that forces you to look at yourself. If you can learn from what you observe, you just may have a chance to keep growing yourself” (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 254-255). In this way, one can practice mindfulness in difficult situations which eventually makes one to search within and grow. In the next chapter, he discusses about the pitfalls while practicing mindfulness. The biggest obstacle is “thinking mind” which wanders here and there and never lets you be in the moment. He also provides solution to this by asking some questions to oneself and again allowing mind to come back to present moment. In the second last chapter, he discusses whether Meditation is spiritual. He does not deny the fact that meditation is a part of spiritual practice, however, he refrains himself using the word “spiritual” in his medicine practice as the word spiritual is interpreted in different ways and might be misleading to his patients, students or readers.

Wherever You Go, There You Are (1994) is a simple guide of Mindfulness practice. In comparison with *Full catastrophe living* (1990), it talks more about the cultural and philosophical

aspects of Mindfulness.

7. Similarities and Differences between Kapleau’s and Kabat-Zinn’s Books

7.1. Similarities

Both the authors have several similarities in their writings. Being borne and brought up in the American society and having knowledge of eastern culture, they create a bridge between east and west. Their writing style is inspirational, engaging and easy to understand, especially for westerners. Examples and illustrations make it easier to understand their teachings which are based primarily on Buddhism. They have given stories about Philosophers, Saints, Zen masters. They have also given details of the programs held at their respective centers and shared the experiences of the students/participants. Small exercises to practice the meditation and other techniques are given in the books so that the readers can try them at home.

Awareness and attention have given primary importance in the practice of Zen and mindfulness. They both discuss about the Buddhist principles such as compassion, non-dualism, non-doing, patience, letting go, Non-judging, trust, simplicity, practice, concentration, emptiness in some or the other way. They also discuss about Anger and how to respond to anger. Kapleau calls anger as the most destructive emotion. One needs to learn to control it. The way of responding to anger is to breathe slowly and deeply from the bottom of the belly. Anger is something that is created by human so the human can ride it. Kabat-Zinn also states “... without

care and awareness, small minded feeling states can dominate the moment. It happens all the time. The collective pain we cause others and ourselves bleed our souls. Hard as it is for us to admit, especially about ourselves, self-tinged anger may be something we indulge in and surrender to far too often” (Kabat-Zinn 2005: 242). Kabat-Zinn also explains the relation of anger and blood pressure. There are also descriptions about Karma. Karma is one of the basic principles which is a continuous process of cause and effect.

The way of practicing Zen and Mindfulness have similar factors such as sitting in particular position, focus on breath, counting the breaths and following the inhalations and exhalations, walking, eating and doing all the actions with awareness etc. 1) Sitting in a Particular position: sitting on the floor with legs crossed or sitting on the floor with placing something (cushion or low wooden bench) in between the legs or sitting on the straight back chair. 2) Posture: the sitting posture should be straight with back neck and head aligned vertically and relaxing the shoulders. 3) Breathing: In Zazen and Mindfulness meditation, one breathes from the belly or lower abdomen and observes the inhalations and exhalations. 4) Walking: walking zazen or Mindful walking is a practice when one walks with full awareness. 5) Every day practice: Kapleau states that “...Those who sit devotedly in zazen every day, their minds free of discriminating thoughts, and it easier to relate themselves wholeheartedly to their daily tasks, and those who perform every act with total attention and clear awareness and it less difficult to achieve emptiness of mind during sitting periods” (Kapleau 1967, II). Kabat-Zinn also

states “The most important part of the work of mindfulness is to keep your practice alive. The way you do that is to do it. It needs to become part of your life, in the same way that eating is or working is” (Kabat-Zinn 2000, 575). Training and dedication are necessary for both the practices. Both the authors emphasize on the application of Zen and Mindfulness in day-to-day life.

With the analysis of Kapleau’s and Kabat-Zinn’s books, it is clear that Zen and Mindfulness have similarities in terms of philosophy and practice. From their writings, it is clear that Zen and Mindfulness can be practiced with any religious background or no religious background. However, the contradiction arises when Kapleau states that Zen is religious practice. He also emphasizes on the religious aspects of Zen such as rituals, chants, Koans, stories of Zen masters etc. He also states that one does not have to be Buddhist to practice Zen. He rather simplifies the concepts and practices for westerners. On the other hand, Kabat-Zinn emphasizes the secular and non-religious nature of Mindfulness but, never denies its Buddhist roots. If Mindfulness practice is inspired by Zen, why it is considered as secular and non-religious practice? Kapleau and Kabat-Zinn do not answer such fundamental questions and some of their statements are paradoxical.

7.2 Differences

There are various factors that differentiate Mindfulness from Zen. The main difference is the purpose of both the practices. The purpose of Zen described by Kapleau is self-realization - *Satori* or enlightenment. There are three aims of Zazen described by Kapleau and they are; Development

of power of concentration (*Jōriki*), Satori awakening (*Kensho Godō*) and Actualization of supreme way in your daily lives (*Mujyōdō no taigen*). Mindfulness does deal with the first aim of Zazen and that is development of power of concentration (*Jōriki*), but it does not emphasize on enlightenment. It rather focusses on wellbeing of people by reducing stress, physical and mental pain.

The second difference is, Zen is a religious practice; whereas, mindfulness is a secular and non-religious practice. In *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965), it is stated that “Briefly stated, Zen is a religion with a unique method of body-mind training whose aim is satori, that is, Self-realization” (Kapleau 1967: xi). In *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994), Kabat-Zinn states that “Religion has traditionally been the domain of such fundamental inquiries within a spiritual framework, but mindfulness has little to do with religion, except in the most fundamental meaning of the word, as an attempt to appreciate the mystery of being alive and to acknowledge being vitally connected to all that exists” (Kabat-Zinn 2005, 5-6). Kabat-Zinn states in one of his papers, “This is plainly stated in the introduction, where I did not shy away from explicitly stating its Buddhist origins. However, from the beginning of MBSR, I bent over backward to structure it and find ways to speak about it that avoided as much as possible the risk of it being seen as Buddhist, ‘new age,’ ‘eastern mysticism’ or just plain ‘flakey’ (Kabat-Zinn 2011: 282).

The third important difference is, Kapleau does not provide any scientific evidence for Zen and does not treat it as a therapy to cure physical and mental problems. He talks about the relation

of Zen and psychotherapy but, psychotherapy is a temporary solution to human suffering; whereas, Zen is a way of living. Kabat-Zinn provide all the scientific evidences possible and emphasizes that Mindfulness is a scientifically proven practice that can reduce stress, mental and physical problems and enhances the quality of life in a broader way. There are explanations about various systems in the body, biological functions and how mindfulness practice help to improve those functions. He also explains that a number of research papers on clinical application of Mindfulness are increasing significantly (Kabat-Zinn 2005: xxx). Kapleau does not advise to practice Zen if a person has severe mental disorders. Zazen may affect him adversely or he may disturb others in their practice. Kabat-Zinn’s purpose of designing MBSR is to reduce stress, chronic pain and mental illnesses.

Zen is practiced either in monasteries, temples or Zen centers. Mindfulness can be practiced in medical institutions, companies, schools, military, prisons etc. The mindfulness programs can be designed for different age groups and their needs. For Zen, the master (Roshi) guides the disciple and assigns practices as per the level of disciples. As per Kapleau, a master (Roshi) is necessary to practice Zen. He guides you to self-realization. Kabat-Zinn does not establish master-disciple relationship in his MBSR program.

Zen explained by Kapleau in his books is based on Soto, Rinzai and Sambo kyodan sects of Zen. Kabat-Zinn’s MBSR has roots in Theravada Buddhism, Mahayana Buddhism (Soto, Rinzai and other Chinese and Korean streams of Zen), Yogic traditions, including Vedanta and teaching of J. Krishnamurti and Ramana Maharshi (Kabat-

Zinn 2011: 289). Kapleau does not emphasize on Yoga. He suggests to do yoga after Zazen. In MBSR or Mindfulness practice, Kabat-Zinn considers Yoga as meditation. Mindful Yoga is must before mindfulness meditation. He provides pictures of Yoga postures that are done in MBSR. In Zazen and Mindfulness sitting meditation, inhaling from belly or lower abdomen is common. However, in MBSR, there are diaphragmatic breathing¹⁷, body scan¹⁸, and various types of sitting meditations. In Zazen, meditation with breathing, meditation with Koan and *Shikan-taza* are practiced. *Shikan-taza* is a Dogen's way of Zazen. Kapleau states "The very foundation of *shikan-taza* is an unshakable faith that sitting as the Buddha sat, with the mind void of all conceptions, of all beliefs and points of view, is the actualization or unfoldment of the inherently enlightened Bodhimind with which all are endowed. At the same time this sitting is entered into in the faith that it will one day culminate in the sudden and direct perception of the true nature of this Mind—in other words, enlightenment. Therefore, to strive self-consciously for satori or any other gain from zazen is as unnecessary as it is undesirable" (Kapleau 1967, 7). In Zen practice, chanting of Dharani¹⁹ and Sutras is done. Practices such as meditating and working with Koan, individual instructions- *Dokusan*, play an important role in Zen. There are rituals for each practice. In Mindfulness practice chanting, Koan practice, *Dokusan*, *Shikan-taza* are not done.

Frequent use of Buddhist vocabulary, Zen vocabulary is found in Kapleau's writings; whereas, Kabat-Zinn's writings, especially in MBSR, focus on mindfulness practice and body functions. He uses simple English terms to

describe mind-body relationship.

Kabat-Zinn's Mindfulness might be easy to understand and practice because it does not expect extensive training and practices that Zen expects. Mindfulness is a quick and easy solution for people who does not have time to follow any religious practices but need peace of mind. However, it does question the authenticity of Mindfulness. Practices like Zen are followed from thousands of years in a set environment and particular setting. Mindfulness never focuses on such aspects. Though it has a great backing of science, it ignores the most important aims that Buddha or any other religious leader has set thousands of years ago. Reducing stress, mental and physical ailments are biproducts of ancient religious practices. Due to such complex nature of Mindfulness, an extensive research is required to prove its authenticity.

7.3 Mindfulness as a Part of Zen

The fundamental differences between Zen and Mindfulness are explained in the previous section. In *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965) Kapleau explains five types of Zen. 1. Ordinary Zen (*Bompu*). It is free for anybody and everybody. One can learn to concentrate and control the mind. 2. An outside way (*Gedō*). It is Zen related to other religious practices such as Yoga, quietest sitting in Confucianism etc. 3. Small vehicle (*Shojō*). It is to achieve peace of mind. 4. Great vehicle or Mahayana (*Daijō*) which is awakening one's true nature. 5. Highest vehicle (*Saijōjō*) is practiced once one achieves Buddhahood (Kapleau 1967: 67). Mindfulness practice can come under the first three types of Zen because

it is for anybody and everybody, it uses Hindu inspired practices such as Yoga and one can achieve peace of mind by practicing it. Kapleau also explains about the four aspirations to do Zazen. 1. Shallowest level where the one has no faith in Zen nor understanding it. They come to Zen with fortunate Karmic circumstances. 2. A desire to do Zazen to improve physical and mental health. 3. A desire to walk a path of Buddha and having faith in enlightenment. 4. A determination to realize one's true nature (Kapleau 1967: 89). Among these, Mindfulness aspirations can be the first two.

However, Mindfulness does not cover all of Zen. MBSR and other MBPs do not talk about notions of rebirth, devotional practices etc. which are the important aspects of Zen (Husgafvel 2019: 42). Mindfulness is influenced by many Buddhist and Yogic traditions. In one of the papers, Kabat-Zinn explains "After all, the mainstreaming of dharma²⁰ through mindfulness is prima facie a positive and healing occurrence and a tremendous opportunity for addressing some of the most fundamental sources of pain and suffering in our world at this moment in time" (Kabat-Zinn 2017: sec. 1, para. 6)". Kabat-Zinn's considers Mindfulness as an opportunity to spread Buddha's teachings but, not within the frame of religion. Kabat-Zinn's contribution is commendable and benefits of Mindfulness are evident but, Zen is more than reducing stress, physical and mental problems.

8. Conclusion

Philip Kapleau and Jon Kabat-Zinn are important figures who not only spread Buddhist teachings

in the American society but also emphasized on its application and practical benefits. Philip Kapleau's *The Three Pillars of Zen* (1965) and *Zen Dawn in the West* (1979) and Jon Kabat-Zinn's *Full Catastrophe Living* (1990) and *Wherever You Go, There You Are* (1994) provide an idea of both the authors' thoughts and approach toward Buddhist teachings. They have similarities in terms of writing style, usage of illustration and examples. Buddhist principles of non-duality, practice, patience, karma etc. are the foundations of Zen as well as of Mindfulness. However, they have fundamental differences in their purpose and some practices.

As per the explanations given in the books, Zen is for the people who are interested in training with Zen masters, learning rituals, texts and attaining enlightenment. Mindfulness is a practice for wellbeing and to improve mental and physical state. Kabat-Zinn's Mindfulness may meet the needs of modern society or provide quick and easy solution to practical problems but, it is also important to check its validity.

The practices they have mentioned in their books are Buddhist or inspired by Buddhism. However, while mainstreaming them in the American society, they focus on simplifying and clarifying the ancient concepts with western vocabulary. Kapleau still sticks to the formal practice of Zen but, Kabat-Zinn oversimplifies and structures it so that they look secular and non-religious. He also takes help of science to prove reliability of Mindfulness practice. His strategies and efforts have worked and meditation has now been available and accessible to anyone and everyone. But, the fundamental concept of religion remains ambiguous and paradoxical.

This analysis is an initial step to understand complexity of both the practices. It is necessary to analyze other works of Kapleau and Kabat-Zinn to know more about reinterpretation and adaptation of Asian religions and their application in the western society.

¹ Dialogue between Masaki Matsubara and Kimiko Bokura.

<https://mag.onyourmark.jp/2016/12/zenandmindfulness/99621> Accessed January 19, 2021.

² Daisetsu Teitaro Suzuki (1870-1966) is an author and scholar of Zen who spread Zen teachings in the United states through his writings and translations.

³ Soen Nakagawa (1907-1984) is a Zen master (Roshi) from Taiwan who completed his training in Rinzaï tradition in Japan.

⁴ Daiun Sogaku Harada (1871-1961) is a Zen master who was trained under Soto and Rinzaï traditions of Buddhism.

⁵ Hakuun Yasutani (1885-1973) is a Zen master and student of Daiun Sogaku Harada (1871-1961), who combined Soto and Rinzaï traditions of Buddhism and formed a new sect called Sambo-Kyodan.

⁶ Sambo Kyodan sect is a Buddhist sect founded by Hakuun Yasutani (1885-1973) which combines both Soto and Rinzaï traditions of Buddhism.

⁷ Koan is a statement, dialogue, story or question given by Zen masters to their disciples. Koan measures the disciples's progress in Zen as it provokes the great doubt.

⁸ Jōshū Jūshin (Chinese: Chao-chou Ts'ung-shen) (1778-897) is one of the great Zen (Ch'an) masters

in ancient china.

⁹ Shunyata is a Buddhist concept which is translated as Emptiness.

¹⁰ Bassui Tokushō (1327-1387) is a Japanese Rinzaï Zen master.

¹¹ Yaeko Iwasaki was a young girl whose enlightenment experience is notable in the history of modern Japanese Zen Buddhism. She was the daughter of Mitsubishi. She was a twenty-five years old who attained enlightenment in five years. (Kapleau 1967: 267-273).

¹² Oxherding pictures is a set of ten Ox pictures. They demonstrate training path in Zen for enlightenment.

¹³ In Zen the word Makyō is used for illusion. Makyō are the illusions that occur during meditation. Hakuun Yasutani describes the term as phenomena-visions, hallucinations, fantasies, revelations, illusionary sensations, where 'ma' stands for devil and 'kyō' stands for objective world (Kapleau 1967: 38).

¹⁴ Bodhidharma is considered as the founder of Ch'an (Zen) who conveyed Buddhism to China.

¹⁵ Hakuin Ekaku (1686-1769) is a Japanese Zen master from Rinzaï sect. He is considered as a reformer of Rinzaï sect.

¹⁶ Huang-po (Chinese: Huangbo Xiyun) (?-849) is a Chinese Zen Master who was very influential during Tang Dynasty.

¹⁷ Diaphragmatic breathing is a breathing technique used in MBSR in which the individuals lie down and breaths from the abdominal region. This type of breathing has a direct connection with nervous system. It relaxes the mind and body.

¹⁸ Body scan is a meditation practice used in MBSR to reestablish contact with the body. In

this meditation, the individual lies down on back and moves the mind through different body parts.

¹⁹ Dharani is a Buddhist chant written in Sanskrit or Pali.

²⁰ Jon Kabat-Zinn used the word ‘dharma’ with lower case “d” ‘to recognize the universal character and applicability of dharma, except in those very specific circumstances where it signifies the traditional Buddhist teachings within an explicitly Buddhist context’ (Kabat-Zinn 2011: 300 n. 1).

References

- Chihara T. 2018 “Dogen’s Zen and Mindfulness”, Komazawa Annual Reports of psychology, 20-1-11.
- Goldberg P. 2010 *American Veda* Three Rivers Press.
- Husgafvel, V. 2019 “The ‘Universal Dharma Foundation’ of Mindfulness-based Stress Reduction: Non- Duality and Mahayana Buddhist Influences in the Work of Jon Kabat-Zinn, Contemporary Buddhism” DOI: 10.1080/14639947.2018.1572329, pp. 42.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. 2000 “Indra's Net at Work: The Mainstreaming of Dharma Practice in Society”. In G. Watson & S. Batchelor (Eds.), *The psychology of awakening: Buddhism, science, and our day-to-day lives* (pp. 225-249). North Beach, ME: Weiser.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. 2005 *Wherever You Go, There You Are*. Hyperion.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. 2013 *Full Catastrophe Living Using Wisdom of your Body and Mind to Face Stress, Pain, and Illness*. Bantam Books.
- Kabat-Zinn J. 2017 “Too Early to Tell: The Potential Impact and Challenges—Ethical and Otherwise—Inherent in the Mainstreaming of Dharma in an Increasingly Dystopian World”. *Mindfulness* 8, 1125–1135. 10.1007/s12671-017-0758-2 - DOI - PMC - PubMed.
- Kalbacher C. L. 1973 “Zen in America”. Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley.
- Kapleau, R. P. 1967 *The Three Pillars of Zen*. Harper and Row, New York.
- Kapleau, R. P. 1979 *Zen Dawn in the West*. Anchor Press edition
- Kucinkas, J. 2019 *The Mindful Elite Mobilizing from the Inside Out*. Oxford University Press.
- Kumano, H., Yokota N. 2020 “Zen kara mita kokoro, maindofurunesu kara mita kokoro” [Mind from the viewpoint of Zen, Mind from the viewpoint of Mindfulness]. Hanazono University Counselling Center bulletin, Vol 14.
- Numrich P. D. 1996 *Old Wisdom in the New World: Americanization in Two Immigrant Theravada Buddhist Temples*. University of Tennessee Press.
- Seager R. H. 1999 *Buddhism in America*. Columbia University Press
- Wilson, J. 2014 *Mindful America*. Oxford University Press.
- <https://www.rzc.org> (accessed on September 21, 2020).
- <http://www.sanbo-zen.org> (accessed on September 21, 2020).
- <https://www.mbsr-study-group.com> (accessed on September 21, 2020).
- <https://www.mindfulnesscds.com> (accessed on September 21, 2020).
- <https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2018/04/>

harvard-researchers-study-how-mindfulness-may-change-the-brain-in-depressed-patients/
(accessed on November 10, 2020)

<https://goamra.org> (accessed on November 10, 2020)

<https://mag.onyourmark.jp/2016/12/zenandmindfulness/99621> (accessed on January 19, 2021).